

National Audit of Internship Acceptances for the Clinical Year 2011

Managing Multiple Acceptances - Part 2

A. Background

Over recent years there has been greater national cooperation regarding intern allocation and recruitment through the setting of shared dates for the process and more discussion regarding common issues with the allocation and recruitment processes.

A national meeting on Intern Allocation was convened by the Confederation of Postgraduate Medical Education Councils (CPMEC) at the November 2009 National Forum. Subsequently a working party was established to further articulate and develop opportunities for the sharing of relevant information related to multiple acceptances¹ of intern offers across jurisdictions.

B. Goals of the process

The National Audit of Intern Acceptances for the Clinical Year 2011 Part 1 will be run as a pilot for eligible medical graduates seeking an internship for the clinical year 2011. The pilot is being run to provide jurisdictions with a greater understanding of:

1. The nature and extent of applicants holding multiple acceptances
2. The resources required for a National Audit process in order to establish the costs and benefits of the process
3. The opportunities and risks that may be involved with any extension of the initial pilot.

All States and Territories have agreed to participate in Part 1 of the National Audit of Intern Acceptances for the Clinical Year 2011.

The Australian Capital Territory, New South Wales, Northern Territory and South Australia, will also participate in an extended pilot (Part 2) which will support the management and resolution of applicants holding multiple acceptances. Queensland, Tasmania, Victoria and Western Australia will not participate in this extension.

C. Benefits of the Process

The National Audit of Multiple Intern Acceptances Part 1 should:

1. Quantify the extent of the perceived problem of multiple acceptances by applicants across jurisdictions.
2. Adhere to privacy legislation and keep the use of, and access to, identifiable information to a minimum.
3. Raise the awareness of applicants to the identified problems associated with holding multiple acceptances for an extended period.
4. Minimise the number of vacant intern positions across jurisdictions at the start of the clinical year
5. Enhance collaboration to support the national priority of providing Australian trained resident graduates with an intern year in light of the expansion of medical graduates.

¹ An acceptance is defined as confirmation in writing from an applicant either by e-mail, letter, returned proforma or on-line notification that they intend to take up a position.

6. Enable consideration of the benefits and risks of other models or modifications to the process.

In addition to the above benefits, the extended pilot (Part 2):

7. Provides a clear and transparent process for managing applicants who have accepted multiple positions.

D. Operational Principles

1. Information requested from jurisdictions shall conform to the minimum agreed data set (Appendix 1) to enable the identification of multiple acceptances and for the preparation of a summary report.
2. The minimum agreed data set shall be: applicant first name, surname, University at which studying, e-mail address, telephone number and residency status (definitions are included at Appendix 1). The number of applicants who have requested that their information is not shared with the central administrator should also be listed in the report. This information will be supplied in an excel spreadsheet to the independent central administrator. In the event that applicants have identical names and cannot be accurately identified, the independent central administrator will contact the relevant state/jurisdiction to request further information in order to identify the applicant.
3. The Audit will only consider allocations and acceptances completed by 27 August 2010.
4. The independent central administrator will use the agreed protocol (Appendix 2) to contact applicants from jurisdictions participating in the extended project who have made multiple acceptances.
5. The names of applicants with multiple acceptances will not be disclosed to states/jurisdictions during the Audit process but will be held by the independent central administrator.
6. The summary report (at Appendix 3) will provide each state/jurisdiction with the number of applicants identified as having accepted internship in more than one state. No names or state data will be divulged in this report.
7. Applicants should not be pressured directly or indirectly by states/jurisdictions or employers to accept one position over another.
8. The offering of inducements or incentives is not supported.
9. At the completion of the audit process each state jurisdiction participating in Part 2 of the audit pilot will be sent a list of applicants and whether or not they have accepted a position in that state/jurisdiction (as at Appendix 4).
10. At the end of the process any vacancies that cannot be filled by an individual jurisdiction may be notified more widely to other jurisdictions at the discretion of the Working Party.
11. A second audit may be conducted in November/December at the discretion of the Working Party
12. An evaluation of the outcome of the National Audit of Intern Acceptances will be undertaken and a report produced and presented to the National Working Party on Intern Allocation at the National Forum

E. Proposed Process

Applicants:

1. will be advised that they should only accept an offer of internship where they intend to take up the position when the clinical year commences. They will also be made aware that by accepting multiple offers for internship they potentially create vacant positions when they fail to take up the position, which can disadvantage their colleagues as well as having significant service implications for the health service.

2. will be made aware that there will be a National Audit of Intern Acceptances and that specified information gained from their application form will be sent to an independent central administrator responsible for administering the National Audit process should they not wish their information to be transferred.
3. will be made aware that if they are identified as having multiple acceptances that they will be contacted by the independent central administrator and will be requested to decide by a certain date which position they will be accepting.

Jurisdictions:

Each jurisdiction/allocation/computer matching body should nominate one person to be the primary liaison contact with the independent central administrator. This person would be responsible for:

4. providing applicant data in the agreed format by the agreed date to the independent central administrator.
5. ensuring applicants are informed about the National Audit process (e.g. Intern Application guide, website), that privacy concerns have been addressed and that there is a process to enable applicants for positions in that jurisdiction to consent to the transfer of the agreed data or to opt out if they wish.
6. ensuring that hospitals (or other employers where relevant) are informed about the process, how it will operate and what is required of them.
7. responding to any queries in relation to the process from applicants and employers.
8. responding to queries from the independent central administrator in relation to information sent.
9. notifying the independent central administrator about any withdrawals that occur between the date that the original data is sent (27 August) and the cut off for acceptances (10 September).
10. notifying the independent central administrator if an applicant contacts them with their decision on which position they are accepting instead of contacting the independent central administrator.
11. receiving information about applicants in their state or territory who have also accepted a position in another state or territory; and for informing employers as appropriate.
12. following up applicants with multiple acceptances who have applied in their jurisdiction and who have not responded to the independent central administrator as to which position they are accepting.
13. providing feedback on the outcome of the process in order to inform an evaluation.

Independent Central administrator:

CPMEC will be providing independent administration for the pilot project. Resources to support this work will be seconded to CPMEC from NSW IMET. The independent central administrator will, in consultation with the working party, be responsible for the implementation of the National Intern Audit process including:

Parts 1 and 2

14. ensuring that jurisdictions have final approval of all documents and processes.
15. responding to any queries in relation to the process from jurisdictions regarding the agreed minimum data set.
16. ensuring that all information received is stored securely in a password protected spreadsheet and that applicants' privacy is protected.
17. checking the information provided by each jurisdiction and liaising with the relevant contact to resolve any issues.

Part 2 only

18. removing data from the spreadsheet relating to applicants in jurisdictions which are not participating in Part 2 of the process

19. analysing the remaining data to enable the identification of applicants who have multiple acceptances and who need to be followed up;
20. sending applicants with multiple acceptances an e-mail (as attached at Appendix 5) indicating that they have been identified as having accepted more than one position and asking them to make a decision by an agreed date as to which position they are accepting. Applicants will be requested to communicate this decision to the central administrator, to the primary liaison officer in the state/territory where the position is being accepted and also to the primary liaison officer in any state/territory where a position is being declined.
21. contacting applicants by telephone if a response is not received.
22. In the event that an applicant does not respond, or is not able to respond to the process outlined above, then, the central administrator will notify the primary liaison officers from the jurisdictions in which the applicant has applied, and ask them to try to resolve this with the applicants directly and then to inform the central administrator of the outcome.

Parts 1 and 2

23. dealing with any grievances that are a direct result of the National Audit pilot.
24. keeping a log of issues that fall out of the process to help inform the evaluation
25. analysing the data received and providing a summary report to the jurisdictions on the outcome of the process in order to evaluate its success.
26. agreeing with the working party what information should be included within the summary report and who should have access to information within the report.

Grievances

27. Grievances that relate directly to the National Audit process and its implementation will be directed to the independent central administrator in the first instance. Depending on the nature of the grievance, the independent central administrator may then discuss with the relevant jurisdiction to agree the appropriate action.
28. The independent central administrator will not respond to grievances relating to allocation, recruitment or employment; applicants will be referred back to the relevant jurisdiction.
29. A log of any grievances received will be kept to inform the evaluation of the process and to assist in planning for subsequent years.

F. Summary of Process and Key Dates

Parts 1 and 2

2010	Description of Activity
By application opening date	Participating States/Territories ensure that applicants are informed about the National Audit process (eg Intern Application Guide, website), that privacy concerns have been addressed and that there is a process to enable applicants to consent to the transfer of the agreed data or to opt out if they wish.
By 27 Aug	Notification of at least first round offers and acceptances to applicants to have been completed.
27 Aug	State/Territory contact sends agreed data set to independent central administrator. Applicants who have not consented to the process are excluded from the data set but the number of non-consenters will be recorded and sent to the central administrator.
30/31 Aug	The independent central administrator reviews information received and resolves any queries with the relevant State/Territory contact.
1 Sep	The independent central administrator informs State/Territory contact of the number of applicants who have accepted an offer in that State or Territory who have also accepted an offer in another State/Territory.

Part 2 only

2 Sep	The independent central administrator contacts applicants with multiple acceptances informing them that they have been identified as having accepted multiple offers. Applicants are then asked to confirm which of the positions they wish to accept by an agreed date.
10 Sep	Applicants to confirm their intentions to the independent central administrator and relevant primary liaison contacts.
13 Sep	Independent central administrator telephones applicants who have still not responded and asks them to confirm their intentions by the end of the day.
13 Sep	Independent central administrator informs State/Territory contact which applicants have accepted a position in their jurisdiction and applicants who have failed to respond who require follow up by the State/Territory contact.

Parts 1 and 2

End of Sept.	Independent central administrator drafts summary report on outcome of the process for discussion and agreement by the Working Party prior to wider release.
Nov	Evaluation of the outcome of the Audit is undertaken and presented to the National Working Party on Intern Allocation at the National Forum

G. Privacy of information provided

The independent central administrator will sign a confidentiality agreement as outlined in Appendix 6, (or equivalent document drafted in the spirit of this agreement approved by the Working Party), which will include confirmation that:

1. all information sent to the independent central administrator will be kept secure and confidential in accordance with privacy legislation.
2. only the independent central administrator of the National Audit of Intern Acceptances will have access to information sent.
3. the independent central administrator will only discuss specifics about any data that is sent with the relevant jurisdiction that it was sent from.
4. all identifying data, documents and back-up will be destroyed once the audit has been completed to the satisfaction of the working party, and no later than the commencement of the 2011 clinical year.

In addition to protect the confidentiality of the information sent:

5. the independent central administrator will be located separately from those conducting the NSW IMET allocation

National Audit of Intern Acceptances for the Clinical Year 2011 Minimum Data Set Part 2

(For completion by the Primary Liaison Contacts in the Australian Capital Territory, New South Wales, Northern Territory and South Australia)

Surname	First Name	University at which applicant is currently studying or where studied	Residency Status*	E-mail address	Phone or Mobile No
Smith	Wendy	Flinders University	Australian trained local (own state)	wsmith@hotmail.com	0111 222222

Number of Applicants who have not consented to the transfer of their information	2
--	---

*Residency status should be defined as one of the following groups:

1) Australian trained local (own state)

Australian Citizen/Permanent Resident graduates from a University in the state of application for PGY1 (includes FFP and CS graduates). Also includes NZ Citizens and Permanent Residents.

2) Australian trained local (interstate)

Australian Citizen/ Permanent Resident graduates from an Interstate University (includes FFP and CS graduates). Also includes NZ citizens and Permanent Residents.

3) Temporary Resident Australian trained (local)

Temporary Resident graduates from a University in the state of application for PGY1.

4) Temporary Resident Australian trained (interstate)

Temporary Resident graduates from an Interstate University.

5) NZ Medical school graduate

NZ medical school graduates including Australian Citizens/Permanent Residents and NZ Citizens/Permanent Residents.

6) Australian Medical Council graduate

These definitions are those used by the Medical Training Review Panel (MTRP) with the exception of Temporary Residents (TR) which are combined in the MTRP reports but have been separated into TR local and interstate for the purposes of this pilot.

Protocol for contacting applicants with multiple acceptances in jurisdictions participating in the extended pilot for Managing Multiple Acceptances

Queensland, Tasmania, Victoria and Western Australia are participating in Part 1 of the pilot project. Australian Capital Territory, New South Wales, Northern Territory and South Australia are also participating in an extended pilot which involves contacting applicants with multiple acceptances to resolve which position an applicant wishes to take up in the 2011 Clinical Year.

On receipt of the applicant data from the jurisdictions the independent central administrator will:

1. Tidy the data and resolve any individual issues with the data set with the relevant primary liaison officer
2. Enter all data into one central spreadsheet
3. Sort the data to identify where there are duplicate applicants and recording the relevant information to produce the required reports
4. The data will then be separated into two spreadsheets as follows:
 - a. Applicants in jurisdictions that are only participating in Part 1 of the pilot i.e. Queensland, Tasmania, Victoria and Western Australia ; and
 - b. Applicants in jurisdictions that are participating in the extended pilot i.e. the Australian Capital Territory, New South Wales, Northern Territory and South Australia

Part 1

5. A summary report will be produced which will provide states/jurisdictions with the number of applicants identified as having accepted internship in more than one state. No names or state data will be divulged in this report.
6. All identifying data, documents and back-up will be destroyed once the audit has been completed to the satisfaction of the working party and no later than the commencement of the 2011 clinical year.

Part 2

7. The independent central administrator will commence the process of contacting applicants who fall into the extended project i.e. those in the Australian Capital Territory, New South Wales, Northern Territory and South Australia.

In contacting applicants the following process would be followed for each of the possible applicant scenarios:

	Multiple acceptances of offers from	Would they receive an email from central admin?
Applicant 1	NSW and NT (or ACT or SA)	√ Yes - because NSW and NT (or ACT or SA) are participating
Applicant 2*	NSW and NT (or ACT or SA) VIC (or QLD or TAS or WA)	√ Yes – because NSW and NT (or ACT or SA) are participating, the email would say, that it has come to our attention that you are holding multiple acceptances in NSW and NT (or ACT or SA).
Applicant 3	NT (or ACT or SA) and VIC (or QLD or TAS or WA)	X No – as VIC (or QLD or TAS or WA) are not participating in the management component, nothing else will be done with the multiple acceptance information and the applicant will not receive an e-mail.

*It should be noted that in this scenario it is possible that an applicant will confirm that they are accepting the position in NSW but may still also be holding an acceptance in Victoria. Although the central administrator may be aware of this, this information will not be disclosed to any of the parties involved.

8. The names of applicants with multiple acceptances will not be disclosed to states/jurisdictions during the Audit process but will be held by the independent central administrator.
9. A summary report will be produced which will provide states/jurisdictions with the number of applicants identified as having accepted internship in more than one state. No names or state data will be divulged in this report.
10. In addition at the completion of the audit process each state/jurisdiction participating in Part 2 of the audit pilot will be sent a list of applicants and whether or not they have accepted a position in that state/jurisdiction.
11. All identifying data, documents and back-up will be destroyed once the audit has been completed to the satisfaction of the working party and no later than the commencement of the 2011 clinical year.

Summary report outlining the number of multiple acceptances by individual Jurisdiction

State/Territory

	Total No. of Acceptances	Total No. of Duplicate Acceptances	No. of applicants with Acceptances from 2 States	No. of applicants with Acceptances from 3 States	No. of applicants with Acceptances from more than 3 States
Australian trained local (own state)					
Australian trained local (interstate)					
Temporary Resident Australian trained (local)					
Temporary Resident Australian trained (interstate)					
NZ Medical school graduate					
Australian Medical Council graduates					
TOTAL					

Summary report listing status of applicants following the audit

Jurisdiction - South Australia

Acceptances (to be listed in alphabetical order)

Name
John Brown
Sean Choi
Danielle Smith

Withdrawals (to be listed in alphabetical order)

Kathryn Aoud
Stephen Dent
Lee Small
Sun Wu

E-mail to be sent to applicants who have multiple acceptances.

2 September 2010

Dear XXXX

We are writing to you to ask you to clarify your choice of internship position for 2011. Our records show that you have accepted an internship position in the following States or Territories (Australian Capital Territory/New South Wales/Northern Territory/South Australia). We would encourage you to decide as soon as possible which position you wish to take up and to advise us by e-mail by no later than **10 September 2010**. Please also advise the primary liaison officers in the relevant States and/or Territories of your intentions (insert contact details here of the primary liaison officers).

Holding on to multiple positions for extended periods of time may impact on the ability of your colleagues to secure a position in the jurisdiction of their choice. If you require further information about the details of positions you may have accepted to aid your decision making please contact the relevant State/Territory contact.

You have received this email as, for the first time this year, a National Audit of Intern Acceptances for the Clinical Year 2011 is taking place. The aim of this Audit is to ensure that applicants have the most equitable and timely opportunity to obtain a PGY1 position in Australia and to minimise the number of vacancies at the start of the Clinical year. All States and Territories are participating in the project.

Queensland, Tasmania, Victoria and Western Australia are not participating in the notification component of the project and it is therefore possible that you may have accepted a position in these States or Territories which is not documented in this email. If this is the case we would still ask that you decide as soon as possible which position you will be taking up and to notify those States and Territories where you have decided not to take up a position accordingly.

If you have any queries in relation to this e-mail please contact the Central Administrator on 02 9844 6535 or 02 9844 6536.

Yours sincerely,

Central Administrator

NATIONAL AUDIT OF INTERN ACCEPTANCES FOR CLINICAL YEAR 2011

CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT

For completion by the Central Administrator

I, name.....understand that, as the independent central administrator for the National Audit of Intern Acceptances pilot project, I may have access to personal information collected for administrative, statistical and other purposes. Such personal information includes the identity of, and personal information about individual persons. This information is strictly confidential and is not to be discussed in the workplace or elsewhere.

I undertake to discuss only matters relevant to the function of the National Audit of Intern Acceptances Audit with other authorised staff within the project and that I will only discuss the specifics about any data that is sent with the relevant jurisdiction that it was sent from.

I undertake not to knowingly access any personal information unless such information is essential for me to properly and efficiently perform my duties.

I undertake to ensure that as far as possible, any confidential information, whether in the form of paper documents, computerised data or in any other form, cannot be viewed by unauthorised persons and that the information is stored in a secure and orderly manner which prevents unauthorised access. I also undertake to ensure that any confidential information is disposed of appropriately at the end of the project.

I understand that failure to observe these instructions is viewed very seriously as it breaches the individual's privacy. I understand that this may constitute grounds for dismissal and places the organisations concerned and the employee at risk of legal action and its consequences.

I further undertake to inform the Chair of the Working Party immediately if I become aware of any breach of privacy or security relating to the information which I access in the course of my duties.

SIGNATURE	
DATE	

Completed forms should be sent to the Chair of the National Allocation Working Group at SAIMET, PO Box 287 Rundle Mall, ADELAIDE SA 5000